



Memorandum

TO: Historic Landmarks Commission

FROM: Courtney Damkroger

SUBJECT: HP03-002
458 North 4th Street

DATE: April 28, 2003

APPROVED:

DATE:

SUPPLEMENTAL

RECOMMENDATION

Planning staff recommends that the Historic Landmarks Commission find that the proposal conforms to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and recommend approval of the proposed alterations to the Director of Planning with standard and special conditions as follow:

1. Find that the colors and materials are in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards
2. Find that the replacement materials for the rear addition portion of the structure are sufficiently compatible without mimicking the historical materials
3. Find that the new gutters are in character with the historical context of the site and structure
4. Recommend approval of the proposed project to the Director of Planning.

BACKGROUND

The Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) discussed the subject project at its March 5th, 2003 public hearing, at which time various issues regarding the project were raised. The Commission voted (7-0-0) to continue the proposal to May 7th, 2003. The Commission included a list of recommended changes, included at the end of this report. On April 16th, 2003, the applicants attended the HLC Design Review Subcommittee meeting to discuss their proposed revisions. The minutes from that meeting are attached.



The Commission was concerned with aspects of the site design, including the close proximity of the parking to the house and the percentage of paving. The Zoning Ordinance does not require any separation between a residence and the parking for that residence. Separation of the parking and residence would reduce the amount of open space in this case, and given the size constraints of the parcel and configuration with the detached garage, separation of the open parking spaces and residence is not feasible. To reduce the amount of impervious surface, the proposed open parking spaces incorporate a permeable design. [The amount of impervious paving including the driveway, walkways, and open space patios represents approximately 25% of the site area.](#)

The HLC expressed interest in returning the front (west) elevation of the residence back to its condition prior to the fire that the structure sustained in 1984. However, the previous owners applied for and obtained final building permits that authorized the repair of fire damage in 1984. Further, the roof was in its existing condition when the Hensley Historic District was established in 1989. For these and additional reasons, the applicant does not propose returning the roof form to its original condition. While restoration of the original roofline would be welcome, staff is not recommending, as a requirement of this Historic Preservation Permit, the restoration of the roofline.

The applicant has responded to recommendations of the HLC by including wood windows for the entire original residence. The windows on the rear addition to the original residence have been changed to double-hung painted vinyl to be more consistent with those in the front of the residence. The size of these windows was also modified to better compliment the original windows.

The HLC recommended changes to both the front and rear porch areas. Bull-nosed tread was incorporated into the plans for both of the porch areas. The roof of the rear porch was changed to a hip roof, and the posts were simplified to be more consistent with the front porch.

[The applicant is proposing wood siding on the rear addition portion of the house. Because matching the width of the 8" siding on the original historic residence would require custom milling, the proposal incorporates 6" wood siding on the rear addition portion of the residence. By matching the materials and slightly modifying the width of each panel, the proposal is in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standard No. 9, which states that additions "shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing." Bull nosed tread is proposed for the water table across the entire residence.](#)

[The rear detached garage was rebuilt in early 2002. As the front \(west\) and common area \(north\) sides of the detached garage are the only sides to be visible from on-site, the applicant now proposes to change the siding on those elevations to match the proposed siding on the rear unit of the residence. Planning staff supports this change. New painted vinyl clad windows, matching those on the rear unit of the residence, are proposed on the north garage elevation. The new entry door on the north elevation would match the entry](#)

door of the rear unit, and the applicant proposes to repaint the garage doors and replace the top panel on each.

Historic Landmarks Commisison Comments from the April 2, 2003 meeting:

CONTINUANCE TO MAY 7, 2003 HLC MEETING IN ORDER TO ADDRESS THE FOLLOWING ISSUES:

- ? **CLOSE PROXIMITY OF PARKING TO THE HOUSE AND THE PERCENTAGE OF PAVING ON SITE**
- ? **RESTORATION OF WEST ELEVATION ACCORDING TO THE 1980 PHOTOGRAPH SUBMITTED BY THE HENSLEY HISTORIC DISTRICT. COMMISSIONERS ALSO ASKED IF REPAIR WORK WAS COMPLETED WITH OR WITHOUT THE BENEFIT OF PERMITS.**
- ? **USE OF CONSISTENT WINDOW SIZE, TYPE, STYLE AND MATERIAL THROUGHOUT THE BUILDING**
- ? **PROVIDE A SECTION DETAIL ON WINDOW PROFILE**
- ? **BULL-NOSED TREAD ON THE STAIR AND PORCH**
- ? **REFINEMENT OF BACK PORCH STAIR AND OVERHANG**
- ? **GREATER DETAIL IN PLANS REGARDING WHAT IS EXISTING**
- ? **UNIFORM SIDING ON HOUSE**
- ? **INTEGRATION OF RELOCATED GARAGE SIDING AND DOOR WITH HOUSE**
- ? **USE OF A CARRIAGE DOOR ON THE GARAGE**